

Don Williams: Shaping the Theology, Praxis, and Culture of Worship in the Vineyard and
Beyond

4000 word essay

(3996 words used with an additional bibliography and discography)

Evangelical & Pentecostal Approaches to Music and Worship, led by Professor Andrew Davies

Module Number 26079

MA/ PG Diploma/ PG Certificate Evangelical & Charismatic Studies

Submitted 09/15/2014

Introduction¹

Don Williams,² “one of the Vineyard’s premier theologians,”³ was the founding pastor of Coast Vineyard Christian Fellowship in La Jolla, CA from 1989 until 2002,⁴ as well as the primary author/editor of the Vineyard Statement of Faith.⁵ In addition to his denominational leadership, pastoral work, and widespread conference speaking, Williams has contributed to numerous articles, essays, and books that focus on worship, including the “charismatic” contribution to *Exploring the Worship Spectrum: 6 Views*.⁶ Moreover, in the widely popular 2006 worship album “Holy,” released by Vineyard Records UK, Don Williams is thanked in the credits for “theological input and tremendous assistance with song selection.”⁷

In this essay I intend to first survey how Williams has shaped the theology, praxis and culture⁸ of charismatic⁹ worship, critically evaluate this contribution, and then demonstrate that

¹ I am indebted to interaction with Caleb Maskell (PhD Candidate, Princeton University, and Steering Committee Chair for the Society of Vineyard Scholars), Michael Raburn (PhD, Duke University, and pastor of Vineyard North in Wake Forest, North Carolina) and Doug Erickson (PhD Candidate, Marquette University). Their observations concerning the Vineyard Movement and Pentecostalism were helpful toward moving beyond simply surveying Don Williams’ work.

² Williams earned a Bachelor of Divinity from Princeton Seminary and a Doctorate of Philosophy in New Testament from Columbia University.

³ Bill Jackson, *The Quest for the Radical Middle: A History of the Vineyard* (Cape Town: Vineyard International Publishing, 1999), Kindle Electronic Edition: Kindle Locations 4390-4391. Furthermore, Williams’ cross-disciplinary work as a theologian, biblical scholar, and pastor has enabled him to have a wide-spread influence among Christian reflection on worship, specifically from the charismatic perspective.

⁴ Cf. Gary S. Greig and Kevin N. Springer, eds., *The Kingdom and the Power: Are Healing and the Spiritual Gifts Used by Jesus and the Early Church Meant for the Church Today?* (Ventura: Regal Books, 1993), 14; “History,” last modified September 9, 2014, <http://coastvineyard.org/new-to-coast/history/>.

⁵ Cf. Jackson, *Quest*, Kindle Location 4391, 5564-5567.

⁶ Paul A. Basden, ed., *Exploring the Worship Spectrum: 6 Views* (Grand Rapids: Zondervan, 2004).

⁷ Nigel Hemming and Brenton Brown, *Holy*, with Wendy O’Connell (nee Whitehead), Nigel Briggs, Daniel Chadney, Esther Alexander, Marc James and Sam Lane, 2006 by Vineyard Records UK, Compact disc. Furthermore, Williams has spent time “working alongside Matt Redman in training young worship leaders in songwriting and theology,” Matt Redman, ed., *The Heart of Worship Files*, (Grand Rapids: Bethany House Publishers, 2003, 2011), Kindle Electronic Edition: Kindle Locations 1950-1951.

⁸ I use the term “culture” here to describe the anthropological phenomena found in churches; for discussion on culture formation, see James K. A. Smith, *Desiring the Kingdom: Worship, Worldview, and Cultural Formation* (Grand Rapids: Baker Academic, 2009).

⁹ While acknowledging the differences between Pentecostal, Charismatic, and Third Wave theology, along with acknowledging that the term “Third Wave” is somewhat misleading, I shall refer to these three distinct theological approaches largely synonymously under the term “charismatic” unless otherwise obvious.

while Williams' work is valuable, it is incomplete. Charismatic theologians must develop their doxology from the ground up while engaging in ecumenical conversation with other traditions.

Don Williams' Biblical Theology of Worship and Six Corresponding Doxological Commitments

In order to properly understand Williams' views concerning worship, it is necessary to understand that his biblical theology¹⁰ of worship extends beyond the popular assumption that 'worship equals music.' According to Williams, "the heart of biblical worship is surrender"¹¹ because "worship is not getting; worship is giving... worship is the basis for a life of self-giving; it is surrendering ourselves to God."¹² Williams believes this to be fundamental toward understanding Christian worship. He writes:

The verb "worship" in Hebrew means to surrender, to fall down in submission—the way we would humble ourselves before a mighty king (see Ps. 95: 6). Paul says that worship is the offering of our bodies as a sacrifice (see Rom. 12: 1). This worship goes on in all of our lives. While we may fail to understand it, worship is the spiritual part of our surrender, submission and attachment to many things.¹³

This, in a sense, would be Williams' *prolegomena* for any discussion on worship.¹⁴ Thus, to reduce worship to music "is reductionistic."¹⁵ This presupposition shapes the entirety of Williams' theology and praxis. For example, underlying Williams work on recovery from

¹⁰ Williams notes the importance of "biblical theology" in the Vineyard by acknowledging George Ladd's influence upon Wimber in his "Theological Perspective and Reflection on the Vineyard Christian Fellowship," *Church, Identity, and Change*, eds. David A Roozen and James R. Nieman (Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 2005), 181-182.

¹¹ Don Williams, *Start Here: Kingdom Essentials for Christians* (Ventura: Regal Books, 2006), 23-24.

¹² Don Williams, "Worship for a Liberated Church," *Worship Update* Volume VII, Number 4 (N.d.), 3-4.

¹³ Don Williams, "We Become Like What We Worship," *The Heart of Worship Files*, Kindle Locations 273-276.

¹⁴ It is outside the scope of this paper to discuss how the kingdom of God was a significant influence for both John Wimber and Don Williams.

¹⁵ Williams, "Theological Perspective and Reflection on the Vineyard Christian Fellowship," 180.

addiction is the assumption that Jesus frees Christians in order to progressively surrender their lives under his lordship.¹⁶

From here, we note Williams' influence in several ways. First, Williams maintains that charismatic worship has continuity with the historic Church in that it "is Trinitarian: worship directed to the Father, through the Son, in the Spirit."¹⁷ As we "turn to the living God," we "bring the sacrifice of our bodies, and they are acceptable to God through the perfect, sinless body of His Son" which leads us to "ask the Spirit of God to fill the hole in the soul with Himself."¹⁸ Charismatic worship "finds its source in the Father, is mediated through the Son, and is empowered and led by the Spirit."¹⁹ Williams' Trinitarian doxology²⁰ would provide a context for understanding the Vineyard praxis of praying the invitation, "Come Holy Spirit."²¹

Second, and related to Williams' *prolegomena*, worship is *embodied*. "As priests," Williams writes, "we are to give God our *bodies*."²² Critiquing the Platonic body-spirit dualism found in popular Christian thinking,²³ Williams believes worship must be expressed.

¹⁶ Cf. Don Williams, "Living with the Free Jesus," *Equipping the Saints* 4, (1994), 4-8. See also Don Williams, *12 Steps with Jesus: How Filling the Spiritual Emptiness in Your Life Can Help You Break Free from Addiction* (Minneapolis: Chosen Books, 2004).

¹⁷ Williams, "Charismatic Worship," *Exploring the Worship Spectrum*, 145.

¹⁸ Williams, "We Become Like What We Worship," Kindle Locations 307-314.

¹⁹ Williams, "Charismatic Worship," *Exploring the Worship Spectrum*, 145. While some have criticized Charismatics as giving too much attention to the Holy Spirit (e.g. John MacArthur, *Strange Fire: The Danger of Offending the Holy Spirit with Counterfeit Worship* [Nashville: Thomas Nelson, 2013]), it would seem fair to respond that perhaps another perspective would be that Charismatics are robustly aware of how doxology is a Trinitarian enterprise.

²⁰ For important work on how charismatic worship is liturgical, and thus the use of doxology is valid, see Simon Chan, *Spiritual Theology: A Systematic Study of the Christian Life* (Downers Grove, IL: 1998); Simon Chan, *Liturgical Theology: The Church as Worshiping Community* (Downers Grove, IL: 2006); For a survey of Chan's charismatic liturgical ideas and influence, see Peter D. Neumann, *Pentecostal Experience: An Ecumenical Encounter* (Eugene, Pickwick Publications, 2012).

²¹ For the background of this prayer, see Jackson, *Quest*, Kindle Locations 955-1028. This prayer is well attested in the history of the church, cf. the Latin prayer *Veni Sancte Spiritus*.

²² Williams, "Worship for a Liberated Church," 4.

²³ For a missional critique of spirit-body dualism, see Michael Frost, *Incarnate: The Body of Christ in an Age of Disengagement* (Downers Grove: InterVarsity Press, 2014).

Williams' theology of worship assumes that Christian anthropology encompasses a thoroughly holistic anthropology.²⁴ This holistic embodied approach is evidenced further when Williams argues that worship includes singing, shouting, prayers, tithes and offerings, acts of mercy, and evangelism.²⁵

Third, in relation to worship being Trinitarian, Williams sees charismatic worship as distinctly *pneumatic* in that it “may be defined theologically as worship where the leadership and gifts of the Spirit (*charismata*) are evidenced or welcomed in personal and corporate praise, responding to a mighty act of God”²⁶ and that this seeks to “restore the Holy Spirit to our services.”²⁷ As Jon Stovell notes, “worship in the Vineyard functions sacramentally, as a space in which one can enter the presence of God and experience his blessings and grace in a unique and powerful way.”²⁸ Williams states that “charismatic worship welcomes [the *charismata*'s] manifestation or release.”²⁹ This includes “the phenomena of singing with arms raised, singing in the Spirit, releasing spiritual gifts such as prophecy, and physical manifestations of the Spirit's power such as shaking or falling.”³⁰

²⁴ Cf. Charles Kraft, *Anthropology for Christian Witness* (Maryknoll: Orbis Books, 1996); Hans Schwarz, *The Human Being: A Theological Anthropology* (Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 2013).

²⁵ Williams, “Worship for a Liberated Church,” 4.

²⁶ Williams, “Charismatic Worship,” 139.

²⁷ *Ibid.*, 145.

²⁸ Jon Stovell, “To Dwell in the House of the Lord: Vineyard Soteriology and Its Praxis in Worship, Discipleship, and Evangelism,” (paper presented at the annual meeting for the Society of Vineyard Scholars, Minneapolis, MN, April 27, 2012), 1. While it is outside the scope of this paper to interact with the idea of how Vineyard sacramental worship is “unique and powerful,” it seems appropriate to acknowledge that work can, and should, be done regarding what is meant by “powerful” experiences in sacramental Vineyard worship. Must a sacramental charismatic vision of worship always be experiential? How might the most mundane, and non-experiential, activities such as simply eating or drinking (1 Cor. 10:31) exist as doxological framed expressions and encounters with God? Furthermore, how does worship function as “space”?

²⁹ Williams, “Charismatic Worship,” 146.

³⁰ *Ibid.*, 149; cf. Mark J. Cartledge, ed., *Speaking in Tongues: Multi-Disciplinary Perspectives* (Milton Keynes: Paternoster, 2006), 209-210.

Fourth, Williams envisions worship as a means of *experiencing God in a transformational encounter*. Building on John Wimber,³¹ Williams stated:

Wimber saw worship as an end in itself. For him, it included both high praise and songs of intimacy, now mostly directed to God himself rather than merely sung about him... As worship ascends, God comes down. He becomes experienced as immanent. In the midst of this worship, people are often convicted, converted, healed, and even delivered from evil spirits. The power of God is often manifest in this worship.³²

Fifth, Williams approaches worship with an eye toward the Psalter,³³ likely influenced by his work on a two volume commentary on the Psalms.³⁴ Noting the contribution of the Reformation and the Jesus Movement toward “the recovery of the use of the psalms in worship and private devotions,” Williams found the Psalms helpful toward a renewal of worship for the church:

The psalms model praise and devotion as they flow from the hearts of people who know the living God. They meditate upon God’s majesty and respond to His intervention by giving Him glory. They ring with shouts and singing. They summon every living being and every human instrument into a choir of praise to the merciful and mighty God (Ps. 150). The renewal of the church begins in a renewal of worship. The psalms will lead us into a deeper intimacy with our Creator and Redeemer and show us how to praise Him properly.³⁵

Finally, approaching doxology with an eye for contextualization and cultural awareness, Williams integrated a commitment to both *understanding* and *engaging* society. For example, early in his work as a youth pastor, Williams observed “the role music played among the

³¹ Wimber and Williams were both colleagues and close friends; see Don Williams “Friend and Encourager,” *John Wimber: His Influence and Legacy* (Guildford: Eagle, 1998), ed. David Pytches, 50-61.

³² *Ibid.*, 142-143.

³³ Cf. Ernest B. Gentile, *Worship God!: Exploring the Dynamics of Psalmic Worship* (Portland: City Bible Publishing, 1994).

³⁴ Donald M. Williams, *The Preacher’s Commentary, Volume 13: Psalms 1-72* (Nashville: Thomas Nelson, 1986) and Donald M. Williams, *The Preacher’s Commentary, Volume 14: Psalm 73-150* (Nashville: Thomas Nelson, 1989); cf. Williams’ chapters “Praise the Lord! A Commentary on Psalm 150” and “Worship with All You Have! Reflections on Psalm 100” in *The Worship Files*.

³⁵ Williams, *Psalms 1-72*, 17.

alienated youth”³⁶ and was soon introduced to the music of Bob Dylan. Dylan so embodied the spirit of the hippie youth culture and so fascinated Williams³⁷ that he started a Bible study called “The Gospel According to Bob Dylan,” which included the performance of Dylan songs and Williams’ commentary. This developed into the formation of the Salt Company Coffeehouse, a widely popular and successful Christian “nightclub,” which led to “the creation of a Sunday morning worship service in a more informal style.”³⁸ This intentional cultural engagement continued in Williams’ later work, as is evidenced by his role in the Vineyard, a community of churches “called to bring the gospel of the kingdom to every nook and cranny of creation, faithfully translating the message of Jesus into language and *forms* that are relevant to diverse peoples and cultures” while promoting “a *creative*, entrepreneurial and *innovative* approach to ministry that is faithful to Jesus and expressive of His heart to reach those who are far away from God.”³⁹

**Toward an Assessment of Don Williams’ Work in Order to
Continue Shaping Charismatic Worship within the Vineyard and Beyond**

While Williams has contributed toward developing a robustly God-centered⁴⁰ approach to worship that begins with surrender and includes the full range of *charismata* in the context of private and corporate worship, more must be said in regards to developing an integrated

³⁶ Larry Eskridge, “God’s Forever Family: the Jesus People Movement in America, 1966-1977” (PhD diss., University of Stirling, 2005), 115.

³⁷ See also Don Williams, *The Man, the Music, the Message: Bob Dylan* (Grand Rapids: Fleming H. Revell Company, 1985).

³⁸ Eskridge, “God’s Forever Family,” 117.

³⁹ “Core Values & Beliefs,” last modified September 10, 2014, <http://www.vineyardresources.com/CoreValuesAndBeliefs.pdf>, 5, emphasis mine.

⁴⁰ Williams directs Christians to center worship on God because “we become like what we worship” and suggests that “idolatry is the issue” in “We Become Like What We Worship,” *The Worship Files*, Kindle Locations 269-287; cf. G. K. Beale, *We Become What We Worship: A Biblical Theology of Idolatry* (Downers Grove: InterVarsity Press, 2008).

sacramental⁴¹ approach to charismatic worship. Specifically related to the undeveloped sacramental vision of Vineyard worship, cues should be taken from Hans Boersma in an attempt to regain a “retrieval (*ressourcement*) of a theology of heavenly participation”⁴² because the Vineyard’s theological heritage has many resources to turn to, including its emphasis on *experience*. This is to suggest that Peter D. Neumann’s observation that “Pentecostalism cannot be rightly understood without an appreciation of the weight granted to encounters with the Spirit as a resource for theological reflection”⁴³ applies to the wider charismatic tradition. How might the Vineyard, and charismatic worship in general, incorporate a sacramental understanding of experience as a means of grace? James K. A. Smith’s advice for charismatics to “drink from our own wells” as they articulate a unique sacramental approach to charismatic doxology stands.⁴⁴

While Williams notes that “baptism is the rite of entry into the Christian life”⁴⁵ and that it “signifies our spiritual exodus, our deliverance from Satan’s kingdom and our entry into God’s kingdom,”⁴⁶ we are left wondering what a pneumatically inspired approach to this sacrament might look like. Does charismatic worship have nothing unique to offer here?⁴⁷ The Vineyard’s theological cousin, Pentecostalism, has acknowledged that “water baptism can be an ecstatic or

⁴¹ I acknowledge that some theologians find the word “sacrament” problematic and prefer “ordinance.” However, the word “sacrament” is used by Anglicans, Lutherans, Reformed, and some Baptists, and none of these groups endorse Roman Catholic sacramentalism. For a defense of its use, cf. James M. Boice, *Foundations of the Christian Faith* (Downers Grove: InterVarsity Press, 1986), 495-97; Wayne Grudem, *Systematic Theology: An Introduction to Bible Doctrine* (Grand Rapids: Zondervan, 1994), 1253; Robert D. Culver, *Systematic Theology: Biblical & Historical* (Ross-shire: Christian Focus, 2005), 976-977.

⁴² Hans Boersma, *Heavenly Participation: The Weaving of a Sacramental Tapestry* (Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 2011), Kindle Electronic Edition: Kindle Location 83.

⁴³ Neumann, *Pentecostal Experience*, 331.

⁴⁴ James K. A. Smith, *Thinking in Tongues: Pentecostal Contributions to Christian Philosophy* (Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 2010), Kindle Electronic Edition: Kindle Location 176.

⁴⁵ Williams, *Start Here*, 40.

⁴⁶ *Ibid.*

⁴⁷ For an example of a charismatic baptistic perspective, see David Pawson, *The Normal Christian Birth: How to Give New Believers a Proper Start in Life* (London: Hodder & Stoughton, 1989, 1997), 44-56. This door is left open by Williams when he writes that baptism “is not just a symbol; it is also an event,” Williams, *Start Here*, 40.

spiritual experience, which leads the new believer to “deeper consecration.”⁴⁸ Opportunities still exist to develop a robustly charismatic doxology that finds a place for water baptism. Williams writes that “what happened to Jesus during baptism must happen to us.”⁴⁹ Charismatics should explore the nature of that event and its implications for charismatic worship.

Moreover, there is virtually *no* mention of the Eucharist in Williams’ published works on worship.⁵⁰ In *Exploring the Worship Spectrum*, Robert E. Webber responded to Williams’ chapter by asking, “Why, after touching on nearly every aspect of worship, is there not one single word or reference to the Eucharist?”⁵¹ This is a valid criticism for charismatic theologians to consider, not simply due to the Eucharist functioning as a central aspect of worship within the New Testament⁵² but also because the Eucharist provides a pneumatological opportunity. Charismatic theologians can certainly continue to ecumenically engage⁵³ with the growing global scholarly community as well as, I think, build upon the Reformed “spiritual presence” view⁵⁴ and connect doxology to the developing Pentecostal ecclesiologies.⁵⁵ Thus, work needs to be done

⁴⁸ Daniel Tomberlin, *Pentecostal Sacraments: Encountering God at the Altar* (Cleveland: Center for Pentecostal Leadership and Care, 2010), 115; Tomberlin states that baptism is a “physical and visible means of grace” (p. 116), which certainly opens the door for a sacramental pneumatic approach.

⁴⁹ Williams, *Start Here*, 147.

⁵⁰ This is not to suggest that Williams did not preach sermons or teach on the subject of the Eucharist.

⁵¹ Robert E. Webber, “A Blended Worship Response,” 163. Webber also asked readers to “consider the attention given to the Eucharist in the New Testament and throughout history.”

⁵² Cf. Thomas R. Schreiner and Matthew R. Crawford, *The Lord’s Supper: Remembering and Proclaiming Christ Until He Comes* (Nashville: B&H Academic, 2010).

⁵³ Wesley Scott Bidy, “Re-envisioning the Pentecostal Understanding of the Eucharist: An Ecumenical Proposal,” *Pneuma: The Journal of the Society for Pentecostal Studies* 28:2 (2006), 228-251.

⁵⁴ See John H. Armstrong, *Understanding Four Views on the Lord’s Supper* (Grand Rapids: Zondervan, 2007), 59-71; Michael F. Bird, *Evangelical Theology: A Biblical and Systematic Introduction* (Grand Rapids: Zondervan, 2013), 784–803; Michael Horton, *The Christian Faith: A Systematic Theology for Pilgrims on the Way* (Grand Rapids: Zondervan, 2011), 798-827; *The Westminster Confession of Faith* (Oak Harbor, WA: Logos Research Systems, Inc., 1996), XXIX; John Calvin and Henry Beveridge, *Institutes of the Christian Religion*, vol. 3 (Edinburgh: The Calvin Translation Society, 1845), 386-456.

⁵⁵ E.g., Simon Chan, *Pentecostal Ecclesiology: An Essay on the Development of Doctrine* (Blandford: Deo Publishing, 2011); Frank Macchia, *Baptized in the Spirit: A Global Pentecostal Theology* (Grand Rapids: Zondervan, 2006), Kindle Electronic Edition: Kindle Locations 3116-5292; John Christopher Thomas, *Toward a Pentecostal Ecclesiology: The Church and the Fivefold Gospel* (Cleveland: CPT Press, 2010). Ecclesiology and the sacraments continues to be two important topics that Pentecostal/Charismatic scholars need to address. I remained

toward developing distinctly integrated charismatic theologies on the Eucharist.⁵⁶ When Webber observed that “charismatics want to be known as those who rediscover the fullness of biblical worship,” he then asked, “Why do you neglect the Eucharist?” Charismatic theologians certainly need a better response. While Williams’ work is important, it is by no means complete, and in some cases, relies upon theological constructs that may be at odds with charismatic theology and praxis,⁵⁷ which is likely due to his theological training and preexisting framework.⁵⁸

Finally, Williams’ theology of “embodied worship” is not developed beyond acknowledging the necessity of rejecting Platonic dualism in encouraging *expressive* worship. I’m inclined to suggest that Smith’s work on cultural formation, specifically related to the role of habits (“dispositions”) would be of help. Discussing habits, “our precognitive tendencies to act in certain ways and toward certain ends,” is valuable toward charismatic doxology because these dispositions “can become so intricately woven into the fiber of our being that they function *as if* they were natural or biological.”⁵⁹

Conclusion

convinced that Chan that ecclesiology is “one of the least developed areas of Protestant thought, especially among evangelicals,” Chan, *Spiritual Theology*, 103; see also Chan, *Liturgical Theology*, 38.

⁵⁶ This looks promising considering the recent publication of Chris E.W. Green, *Toward a Pentecostal Theology of the Lord’s Supper: Foretasting the Kingdom* (Cleveland: CPT Press, 2014). I would suggest that interaction with Boersma, *Heavenly Participation*, Geoffrey Wainwright’s *Eucharist and Eschatology* (Werrington: Epworth Press, 1971, 2003) and *Doxology: The Praise of God in Worship, Doctrine, and Life* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1980) would prove fruitful, as well as engaging William L. De Arteaga’s suggestion that there is a connection between revival and the Eucharist in *Forgotten Power: The Significance of the Lord’s Supper in Revival* (Grand Rapids: Zondervan, 2002).

⁵⁷ This is the strong criticism of Kenneth J. Archer, see “A Pentecostal Way of Doing Theology: Method and Manner,” *International Journal of Systematic Theology* 9:3 (2007), 301-314; *A Pentecostal Hermeneutic: Spirit, Scripture, and Community* (Cleveland: CPT Press, 2009); cf. arguments made in Douglas G. Jacobsen, *Thinking in the Spirit: Theologies of the Early Pentecostal Movement* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2003).

⁵⁸ Williams was trained as and pastored initially as a Presbyterian in the 1960’s. This certainly influenced his epistemology and theology. Furthermore, when he helped develop Wimber’s theology, he turned to his “evangelical context” as a resource, cf. Don Williams, “Friend and Encourager,” in *John Wimber*, 54.

⁵⁹ Smith, *Desiring the Kingdom*, 55-56. If charismatic worship is both God-centered and truly encompassed by the “surrender” motif, a thickened articulation of the role of habits, spiritual disciplines, and sacramental awareness is in order. See also James K. A. Smith, *Imagining the Kingdom: How Worship Works* (Grand Rapids: Baker Academic, 2013).

Don Williams' contribution to charismatic worship is tremendous, weighty, and to be appreciated, as well as engaged. Spanning over thirty-plus years, Williams' work has both developed and spearheaded ongoing development toward charismatic worship.⁶⁰ This is to say that among the giants who have developed charismatic worship, Don Williams stands. Yet the work is not complete!

Charismatic worship has an opportunity to both articulate and integrate a sacramental doxology that is shaped by experience. As the shackles of modernism are shed and the deconstruction of postmodernism is weighed and found incomplete,⁶¹ the way(s) forward require that Charismatics consider the rich heritage of the past while looking to the future.⁶²

This leads me to conclude with more questions than answers. How might charismatic worship incorporate a sacramental awareness that relates to the commitment of "experiencing God's presence"? In what specific ways might charismatics embrace a sacramental approach, and whose sacramental approach is best to engage?⁶³ The conversation partners are numerous and the diversity within each of these traditions invites further dialogue. Finally, how might Charismatics "drink from [their] own wells" when it comes to developing, articulating, and incorporating their pneumatic sacramental doxology?

⁶⁰ I believe this paper, and work that is being done in both the Society of Vineyard Scholars, and in the wider Vineyard movement, is testimony to this.

⁶¹ I agree with Boersma, who writes, "I agree with the common perception that postmodernity is little more than modernity coming home to roost. Both, I believe, are predicated on the abandonment of a premodern sacramental mindset in which the realities of this-worldly existence pointed to greater, eternal realities in which they sacramentally shared" (*Heavenly Participation*, Kindle Locations 75-77).

⁶² This might be considered a "pneumatic ancient-future faith," to build off of Smith (James K. A. Smith, *Who's Afraid of Postmodernism: Taking Derrida, Lyotard, and Foucault to Church* [Grand Rapids: Baker Academic, 2006]) and Webber (Robert Webber, *Ancient-Future Faith: Rethinking Evangelicalism for a Postmodern World* [Grand Rapids: Baker, 1999]).

⁶³ E.g., the Roman Catholics? The Orthodox? Anglicans? Lutherans?

Bibliography

- Alvarado, Johnathan E. "Worship in the Spirit: Pentecostal Perspectives on Liturgical Theology and Praxis." *Journal of Pentecostal Theology* 21 (2012): 135-151.
- Armstrong, John H., ed. *Understanding Four Views on Baptism*. Grand Rapids: Zondervan, 2007.
- _____. *Understanding Four Views on the Lord's Supper*. Grand Rapids: Zondervan, 2007.
- Basden, Paul A. ed. *Exploring the Worship Spectrum: 6 Views*. Grand Rapids: Zondervan, 2004.
- Beale, G. K. *We Become What We Worship: A Biblical Theology of Idolatry*. Downers Grove: InterVarsity Press, 2008.
- Biddy, Wesley Scott. "Re-envisioning the Pentecostal Understanding of the Eucharist: An Ecumenical Proposal." *Pneuma: The Journal of the Society for Pentecostal Studies* 28:2 (2006): 228-251.
- Bird, Michael F. *Evangelical Theology: A Biblical and Systematic Introduction*. Grand Rapids: Zondervan, 2013.
- Boersma, Hans. *Heavenly Participation: The Weaving of a Sacramental Tapestry*. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 2011.
- Boice, James M. *Foundations of the Christian Faith*. Downers Grove: InterVarsity Press, 1986.
- Burgess, Stanley M., ed. *The New International Dictionary of Pentecostal and Charismatic Movements*, Revised and Expanded Edition. Grand Rapids: Zondervan, 2002, 2003.
- Calvin, John, and Henry Beveridge, *Institutes of the Christian Religion*. Edinburgh: The Calvin Translation Society, 1845.
- Cartledge, Mark J., ed. *Speaking in Tongues: Multi-Disciplinary Perspectives*. Milton Keynes: Paternoster, 2006.
- Chan, Simon. *Liturgical Theology: The Church as Worshiping Community*. Downers Grove: InterVarsity Press, 2006.
- _____. *Pentecostal Theology and the Christian Spiritual Tradition*. Eugene: Wipf & Stock, 2011.
- _____. *Spiritual Theology: A Systematic Study of the Christian Life*. Downers Grove: InterVarsity Press, 1998.

- Culver, Robert D. *Systematic Theology: Biblical & Historical*. Ross-shire: Christian Focus, 2005.
- De Arteaga, William L. *Forgotten Power: The Significance of the Lord's Supper in Revival*. Grand Rapids: Zondervan, 2002.
- Eskridge, Larry. "God's Forever Family: the Jesus People Movement in America, 1966-1977." PhD diss., University of Stirling, 2005.
- Frost, Michael. *Incarnate: The Body of Christ in an Age of Disengagement*. Downers Grove: InterVarsity Press, 2014.
- Gentile, Ernest B. *Worship God!: Exploring the Dynamics of Psalmic Worship*. Portland: City Bible Publishing, 1994.
- Green, Chris E.W. *Toward a Pentecostal Theology of the Lord's Supper: Foretasting the Kingdom*. Cleveland: CPT Press, 2014.
- Greig, Gary, and Kevin Springer, eds. *The Kingdom and the Power: Are Healing and the Spiritual Gifts Used by Jesus and the Early Church Meant for the Church Today?*. Ventura: Gospel Light, 1993.
- Grudem, Wayne. *Systematic Theology: An Introduction to Bible Doctrine*. Grand Rapids: Zondervan, 1994.
- Horton, Michael. *The Christian Faith: A Systematic Theology for Pilgrims on the Way*. Grand Rapids: Zondervan, 2011.
- Jackson, Bill. *The Quest for the Radical Middle: A History of the Vineyard*. Cape Town: Vineyard International Publishing, 1999.
- Kraft, Charles. *Anthropology for Christian Witness*. Maryknoll: Orbis Books, 1996.
- Letham, Robert. *The Holy Trinity: In Scripture, History, Theology, and Worship*. Phillipsburg: P&R Publishing, 2004.
- Luhrmann, T. M. *When God Talks Back: Understanding the American Evangelical Relationship with God*. New York: Random House, 2012.
- MacArthur, John. *The Charismatics*. Grand Rapids: Zondervan, 1978.
- _____. *Charismatic Chaos*. Grand Rapids: Zondervan, 1992.
- _____. *Strange Fire: The Danger of Offending the Holy Spirit with Counterfeit Worship*. Nashville: Thomas Nelson, 2013.

- Macchia, Frank. *Baptized in the Spirit: A Global Pentecostal Theology*. Grand Rapids: Zondervan, 2006.
- Nathan, Rich, and Ken Wilson. *Empowered Evangelicals: Bringing Together the Best of the Evangelical and Charismatic Worlds*, Revised and Updated Version. Boise: Ampelon Publishing, 2009.
- Neumann, Peter D. *Pentecostal Experience: An Ecumenical Encounter*. Eugene, Pickwick Publications, 2012.
- Parry, Robin A. *Worshipping Trinity: Coming Back to the Heart of Worship*. Eugene: Cascade Books, 2012.
- Pawson, David. *The Normal Christian Birth: How to Give New Believers a Proper Start in Life*. London: Hodder & Stoughton, 1989, 1997.
- Pinson, J. Matthew, ed. *Perspectives on Christian Worship: 5 Views*. Nashville: Broadman & Holman Publishers, 2009.
- Pytches, David, ed. *John Wimber: His Influence and Legacy*. Guildford: Eagle, 1998.
- Redman, Matt, ed., *The Heart of Worship Files*. Grand Rapids: Bethany House, 2003, 2011.
- Roozen, David A., and James R. Nieman. *Church, Identity, and Change: Theology and Denominational Structures in Unsettled Times*. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 2005.
- Schreiner, Thomas R., and Shawn D. Wright. *Believer's Baptism: Sign of the New Covenant in Christ*. Nashville: Broadman and Holman Publishers, 2006.
- Schreiner, Thomas R., and Matthew R. Crawford, eds. *The Lord's Supper: Remembering and Proclaiming Christ until He Comes*. Nashville: Broadman and Holman Publishers, 2010.
- Schwarz, Hans. *The Human Being: A Theological Anthropology*. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 2013.
- Smith, James K. A., *Desiring the Kingdom: Worship, Worldview, and Cultural Formation*. Grand Rapids: Baker Academic, 2009.
- _____. *Imagining the Kingdom: How Worship Works*. Grand Rapids: Baker Academic, 2013.
- _____. *Who's Afraid of Postmodernism: Taking Derrida, Lyotard, and Foucault to Church*. Grand Rapids: Baker Academic, 2006.
- Stovell, Jon. "To Dwell in the House of the Lord: Vineyard Soteriology and Its Praxis in Worship, Discipleship, and Evangelism." Lecture, Society of Vineyard Scholars Annual Meeting, Minneapolis, MN, April 27, 2012.

- Thiselton, Anthony C. *The Holy Spirit – In Biblical Teaching, through the Centuries, and Today*. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 2013.
- Thomas, John Christopher. *Toward a Pentecostal Ecclesiology: The Church and the Fivefold Gospel*. Cleveland: CPT Press, 2010.
- Tomberlin, Daniel. *Pentecostal Sacraments: Encountering God at the Altar*. Cleveland: Center for Pentecostal Leadership and Care, 2010.
- Venter, Alexander. *Doing Church: Building from the Bottom Up*. Cape Town: Vineyard International Publishing, 2000.
- _____. *Doing Healing: How to Minister God’s Kingdom in the Power of the Spirit*. Cape Town: Vineyard International Publishing, 2009.
- Wainwright, Geoffrey. *Doxology: The Praise of God in Worship, Doctrine, and Life*. New York: Oxford University Press, 1980.
- _____. *Eucharist and Eschatology*. Werrington: Epworth Press, 1971, 2003.
- Webber, Robert. *Ancient-Future Faith: Rethinking Evangelicalism for a Postmodern World*. Grand Rapids: Baker, 1999.
- Williams, Donald M. *The Preacher’s Commentary, Volume 13: Psalms 1-72*. Nashville: Thomas Nelson, 1986.
- _____. *The Preacher’s Commentary, Volume 14: Psalm 73-150*. Nashville: Thomas Nelson, 1989.
- Williams, Don. “Disarming the Devil.” *Equipping the Saints* Vol. 7, Num. 1 (1993): 7-10.
- _____. “Hearing God’s Voice.” *Equipping the Saints* Vol. 3, Num. 1 (1989): 20-22, 30.
- _____. “Living with the Free Jesus,” *Equipping the Saints* Vol. 8, Num. 4, (1994): 4-8.
- _____. *Signs, Wonders, and the Kingdom of God: A Biblical Guide for the Reluctant Skeptic*. N.p.: n.p, n.d..
- _____. *Start Here: Kingdom Essentials for Christians*. Ventura: Regal, 2006.
- _____. “Worship for a Liberated Church.” *Worship Update* Vol. VII, Num. 4 (n.d.): 1-4.
- _____. *12 Steps with Jesus: How Filling the Spiritual Emptiness in Your Life Can Help You Break Free from Addiction*. Minneapolis: Chosen Books, 2004.

Wimber, John. *Everyone Gets to Play: John Wimber's Writings and Teachings on Life Together in Christ*. Boise: Ampelon Publishing, 2008.

_____. *The Way In Is the Way On*. Boise: Ampelon Publishing, 2006).

Wimber, John, and Kevin Springer. *Power Evangelism*. Ventura: Regal, 2009.

Discography

Hemming Nigel, and Brenton Brown. *Holy*. With Wendy O'Connell (nee Whitehead), Nigel Briggs, Daniel Chadney, Esther Alexander, Marc James and Sam Lane. © 2006 by Vineyard Records UK, Compact disc.